Social Media Follow-Up Audit
May 2014

Craig Terrell, Interim City Auditor
Michelle Brown, Staff Auditor

Social Media Follow-Up Audit
Table of Contents

Social Media Follow-Up Audit

Office of the City Auditor
Craig Terrell, CPA
Interim City Auditor

Project #14-08   *May 14, 2014*

Executive Summary

Eight of ten prior audit recommendations were fully implemented

Fully Implemented

Modify the City's website

Ensure compliance with the Social Media Policy

Train moderators on the Social Media Policy

Require only one department maintain a list of social media accounts

Revise policy concerning negative/inappropriate feedback and unauthorized accounts

Establish key metrics

Require strong passwords

Delegate authority for creating accounts

Partially Implemented

Collaborate to promote an identifiable brand

Not Implemented

Incident Response Plan

As part of the Fiscal Year 2014 Annual Audit Plan, the City Auditor's Office has completed a follow-up audit of the Social Media Audit released in August 2013. The audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. The audit objective was to determine the implementation status of prior audit recommendations.

Management concurred with all ten recommendations in the initial audit report. Audit follow-up indicates that management fully implemented eight recommendations, partially implemented one and did not implement one.

Management has created a dashboard page of social media accounts on the City website, making navigation of social media easier for citizens. Additionally, the City's Social Media Policy has been revised to encourage departments to establish and track key metrics and includes procedures for addressing negative and inappropriate feedback. Also, the policy now requires that only one department maintains a master list of social media accounts and mandates the use of strong passwords. Additionally, the Social Media Policy was updated to require that only those with signature authority create social media accounts. However, testing showed that a new social media account was created by an employee without such authority. The updated policy along with training information was distributed to department heads and social media moderators.

Management has partially implemented one recommendation. Progress has been made toward departmental collaboration to promote an identifiable brand in social media. While the recommendation is considered partially implemented, it should be noted that the target date has not yet passed.

Management has not created an Incident Response Plan as indicated in the initial audit response.

Implementation Status Chart

Finding	Recommendation	Status	Page
Social media sites do not depict an identifiable brand that is unified across City Departments.	Modifications should be made to the City's website	✔	4
	Departments should collaborate to promote and identifiable brand and engage citizens	✔	4
Social media accounts are not created and managed in accordance with the City's Social Media Policy.	Departments should comply with the Social Media Policy	✔	5
	Social media moderators should be trained	✔	6
	The Social Media Policy should be revised to require that only one department maintain a list of City accounts	✔	6
Social media sites are not routinely monitored to identify inappropriate feedback or unauthorized accounts.	Social Media Policy should be updated concerning feedback and unauthorized accounts	✔	7
Social media performance is not tracked.	Social media metrics should be developed	✔	8
The City's social media policy does not require the use of strong passwords for social media accounts.	The Social Media Policy should mandate the use of strong passwords for accounts	✔	8
The City does not have an Incident Response Plan.	An Incident Response Plan should be developed and implemented	X	9
The Social Media Policy does not give clear authority to individual staff members to legally bind the City in agreeing to terms with social media providers.	Social Media Policy should delegate authority to account administrators to create social media accounts	✔	9

Implementation Status

✔: **Fully Implemented**
✔: **Partially Implemented**
X: Not Implemented

Audit Scope and Methodology

The following methodology was used in completing the audit.

- Interviewed City social media moderators
- Reviewed Social Media Policy
- Reviewed content and procedures used to establish City social media pages

Status of Prior Audit Recommendations

> *Prior Audit Finding*
> **Social Media sites do not depict an identifiable brand that is unified across City departments.**

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that the Office of Communications, in conjunction with user departments, modifies the City's website to make it easier for citizens to find information.

Management's Response: *Concur. Currently, there are links on the City's main website to all City social media sites including Facebook, Twitter, Pinterest and YouTube. But, there are not links to the social media sites for other City departments like Police, Fire, Library and Parks and Recreation. Office of Communications will create a dashboard page that will contain a link to all of those pages as a part of the website relaunch.*

 Target Date: August 30, 2013
 Responsibility: Web Designer

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The Office of Communication has created a dashboard page of the City's social media accounts on the City website. The dashboard is accessible through the "Contact Us" link on the City website.

Return to Summary

Recommendation: The Office of Communications should provide guidance to City departments regarding how they can collaborate to promote an identifiable brand while engaging citizens through social media.

Management's Response: *Concur. The City is currently in the process of evaluating its current brand and developing a new cohesive brand strategy. This project is being conducted in conjunction with the redesign of the City's website. The new brand will then be incorporated into the City's social media sites through logos, consistent design, and key phrasing.*

 Target Date: July 2014
 Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communication Manager

Implementation Status: Partially Implemented.

While the City Auditor's Office is aware that the target date has not yet passed, according to management, the Office of Communication has made some progress. The OOC has worked with departments that have started new social media pages to ensure that their pages are appropriately titled.

Additionally, the new city website will be fully integrated with the City's new brand and logo. This site is set to launch on June 24, 2014. Each department will be responsible for the content on their

page of the website and we will provide those departments with a branding style guide to provide cohesiveness between all pages. The same branding style guide will be utilized with the City's social media pages to ensure appropriate wording, colors, font and logo when and where appropriate.

Return to Summary

Prior Audit Finding
Social media accounts are not created and managed in accordance with the City's Social Media Policy.

Recommendation: The City Manager should require that Department Heads ensure compliance with the city-wide Social Media Policy.

Management's Response: *Concur. The Office of Communications will update the Social Media Policy and distribute it annually to all Department Heads, at the direction of the City Manager.*

> *Target Date: September 30, 2013*
> *Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager*

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The City's Social Media Policy was updated October 15, 2013. According to management, the updates were communicated to department moderators via email. The new policy is also available on the portal page and web page for the Office of Communication. Additionally, the Office of Communication presented changes to the policy in the director's meeting on August 7, 2013.

Return to Summary

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that social networking moderators are trained regarding the city-wide Social Media Policy, including updating, records retention, and disclosure requirements.

Management's Response: *Concur. The Office of Communications will distribute the updated Social Media Policy to all social networking moderators. Additionally, each moderator will receive a training guide with guidance on updating sites, branding, records retention and disclosure requirements.*

> *Target Date: September 30, 2013*
> *Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager*

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The Social Media Policy includes language that requires moderators be trained regarding the terms of the policy, which has been updated to address frequency of site updates and records retention. While the updated policy states that it is the responsibility of department heads to ensure that employees are aware of the guidelines for creating and maintaining social media sites, the Office of Communication has made the policy available on the City's portal and website. The updated policy

was distributed to moderators in each department along with one page summary of the policy titled "Social Media 101".

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that the Social Media Policy is revised to no longer require that two departments maintain a list of the City's social media sites and services.

Management's Response: *Concur. Moving forward, OOC will maintain the only list of social media sites for the City. This change will be reflected in the updated Social Media Policy.*

> *Target Date: September 30, 2013*
> *Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager*

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The City's Social Media Policy was updated October 15, 2013 and now requires that only the Office of Communication maintain a list of social media sites and services which have been approved for use by City departments and staff.

Prior Audit Finding
Social media sites are not routinely monitored to identify inappropriate feedback or unauthorized accounts.

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that the city-wide Social Media Policy is updated to address how staff should respond to negative and inappropriate feedback and should include procedures that help identify and deactivate unauthorized social media accounts in a timely manner.

Management's Response: *Concur. Social media is a constantly evolving medium and as such the City's policy dealing with social media should be periodically updated. Office of Communications will update the City's Social Media Policy with provisions for responding to negative/inappropriate feedback and comments on City social media sites. Additionally, the policy will be updated with a guideline for deactivating City maintained social media sites that are updated infrequently.*

> *Target Date: September 30, 2013*
> *Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager*

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The City's updated Social Media Policy requires compliance with record retention policies including that content not be deleted. Additionally, the policy now includes specifics concerning etiquette, moderation and engagement.

The initial audit found that five of 28 sampled Facebook accounts do not address citizens' posts or feedback. Current reviews of those exceptions noted that the pages were updated regularly and appear to be responding appropriately to citizen feedback.

According to management, there are still no procedures in place to identify and deactivate unauthorized social media accounts. However, a number of legitimate City accounts with little to no activity were deactivated, including several in the Police Department.

Return to Summary

Prior Audit Finding
Social media performance is not tracked.

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that the city-wide Social Media Policy is updated to address the establishment of key metrics by which data can be collected and used to measure and report performance.

Management's Response: *Concur. For the past several years, the Office of Communications has tracked key metrics of the City's social media pages, providing detailed comparisons of the City's individual department social media pages and comparisons to the social media sites of surrounding cities. OOC will continue to track these key metrics. Additionally, the updated Social Media Policy will direct moderators of individual departmental social media sites to collect their own key metrics.*

> *Target Date: September 30, 2013*
> *Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager*

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The City's Social Media Policy has been updated to encourage departments to review social media analytics in an effort to measure the effectiveness of social media communication and engagement. The Office of Communication creates a monthly tracking report of social media metrics for nine of the City's 106 Facebook accounts and six of the City's 16 Twitter accounts. Since the initial audit the OOC has added the Fire Department Facebook page to metrics report. They have also begun tracking Facebook and Twitter quarterly growth.

Return to Summary

Prior Audit Finding
The City's social media policy does not require the use of strong passwords for social media accounts.

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that the city-wide Social Media Policy is updated to mandate the use of strong passwords that are periodically changed.

Management's Response: *Concur. Strong passwords that are changed on a regular basis should be utilized for all City social media sites. OOC will send a quarterly email reminder to all city employees responsible for monitoring social media sites, directing them to change their passwords and recommending those passwords conform to City guidelines for strength.*

     Target Date: August 30, 2013
     Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

The City's updated Social Media Policy has been update to require that social media passwords conform to the City's strong password guidelines. Passwords must also be changed on a quarterly basis. The Office of Communication sends quarterly email reminders to department moderators and tracks passwords and changes in the City social media list that they maintain.

Prior Audit Finding
The City does not have a documented Incident Response Plan.

Recommendation: The Chief Information Officer should require that a documented Incident Response Plan be implemented that addresses social media risks.

Management's Response: *Concur. As part of the overall formal IT security program development, IT will publish standards for security administration and incident response for Social Media. Included in this publication will include expectations of users and departments on such topics as UserID and Password standards, business unit department incident response requirements and other areas of functional capability under the City of Arlington's control.*

     Target Date: December 31, 2013
     Responsibility: Dennis John, Chief Information Officer

Implementation Status: Not Implemented.

The IT Department submitted a budget issue for a security program that was deferred as part of the 2014 Budget. The requested security program sought to hire a vendor to establish a City-wide security program, manage the implementation of the recommendations from the security assessment and oversee the application of security best practices throughout the organization. The Incident Response Plan would have been part of this security program. However, since there is no funding available, IT management has indicated that the department does not possess the needed skills or staffing capability to establish or implement an Incident Response Plan that would address social media risks in the originally committed timeframe.

Prior Audit Finding
The Social Media Policy does not give clear authority to individual staff members to legally bind the City in agreeing to terms with social media providers.

Recommendation: The Chief Financial Officer should ensure that staff, upon City Manager approval, updates the Social Media Policy to specifically delegate authority to account administrators to create social media accounts.

Management's Response: *Concur. The Office of Communications will work with the CAO to include appropriate guidelines regarding website agreements in the updated Social Media Policy.*

    Target Date: September 30, 2013
    Responsibility: Jay Warren, Marketing Communications Manager

Implementation Status: Fully Implemented.

While the Office of Communication does not specifically track who creates social media accounts, they have updated the Social Media Policy to include the following language, "When creating a social media account, only those employees with City signature authority to execute contracts are authorized to legally bind the City when agreeing to terms and conditions with a social media provider. If no one within a department has signatory authority, the City Manager or a Deputy City Manager will be responsible for agreeing to the terms and conditions."

According to the Office of Communication, they have taken steps to ensure that department heads are aware of the guidelines concerning creating social media so they implement procedures in their own departments to comply. However, it was noted during testing that the only social media account established since the initial audit was created by an employee in the Water Utilities Department without signature authority.

Return to Summary